

Bayshore In Grove, Inc

Resolution

2020

RESOLUTION REQUESTING THE CITY OF MIAMI COMMISSION DENY THE APPEAL FILED BY THE CONVENT OF THE SACRED HEART OF MIAMI AKA CARROLLTON CONCERNING ITS PROPOSED NEW SCHOOL AT 2167 SOUTH BAYSHORE DRIVE

A RESOLUTION OF BAYSHORE IN GROVE INC REQUESTING THE CITY OF MIAMI COMMISSION DENY THE APPEAL FILED BY THE CONVENT OF THE SACRED HEART OF MIAMI, INC. AND AFFIRM THE DECISION OF THE MIAMI HISTORIC AND ENVIRONMENTAL PRESERVATION BOARD'S DENIAL OF THE APPLICATION FOR A SPECIAL CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL AND FOR A SPECIAL CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS THAT WOULD ALLOW A NEW SCHOOL FOR 336 STUDENTS PLUS 50 TEACHERS TO BE BUILT ON THE ENVIRONMENTALLY PROTECTED AND HISTORICALLY DESIGNATED VILLA WOODBINE PROPERTY AT APPROXIMATELY 2167 SOUTH BAYSHORE DRIVE, MIAMI FL 33133.

WHEREAS, BAYSHORE IN GROVE INC is committed to advocating for responsible development and planning practices that sustain a community-oriented quality of life, improves resiliency and protects the natural resources of the Coconut Grove community; and

WHEREAS, the Convent of the Sacred Heart of Miami is requesting reversal of the Historic Preservation and Environmental Preservation Board's (HEPB) 2019 denial of applications for a "Special Certificate of Appropriateness and Certificates of Approval" for the proposed school at 2167 South Bayshore Drive otherwise known as the Carrollton School at Villa Woodbine ("the Project"); and

WHEREAS, a) the proposed use does not provide public benefit and is not the minimum necessary to encourage or assure the continued preservation of historic structure; b) the proposed use is injurious to the neighborhood and is detrimental to the public welfare; and c) the Project is not designed and sited in a manner that minimizes the impact on the surrounding areas in terms of vehicular ingress and egress, off street parking, pedestrian safety and convenience, public utilities and services, lighting, noise, or potential adverse impacts; and

WHEREAS, the Villa Woodbine property is located within *Environment Preservation District - 60* and the *South Bayshore Drive Scenic Transportation Corridor* which protects the significant existing features of the site such as historic oolitic limestone rock walls, archeological sensitive limestone bluff known as the Silver Bluff and mature, dense tree canopy; and

WHEREAS, BAYSHORE IN GROVE INC agrees with the concerns expressed by Dade Heritage Trust in a 2019 letter to the City's Historic Environmental Preservation Board regarding "the Project's Effect on the Villa's Silver Bluff Setting. DHT is concerned that any building on or between the Bluff and South Bayshore Drive may have a negative impact on the important archaeological and environmental feature that is Coconut Grove's Silver Bluff." The Applicant subsequently filed a site plan which indicates a 12,450 SF pool/deck is located 20 FT from South Bayshore Drive, and will completely obstruct site lines into the protected Silver Bluff, and testified that the bluff would at best be viewed from a 10 X 20 observation-viewing platform built around a southern oak between the auditorium and the pool; and

WHEREAS, the Project lacks compatibility with the existing single-family neighborhood in height, massing and use with a footprint of proposed new construction of 45,562 SF, eight (8) times larger than the 5,658 SF existing Villa Woodbine; and

WHEREAS, the applicant's filed landscape drawings state that the Project involves removal of 173 trees of the 220 trees reported on the property. The proposed site of 104,647 SF of non-pervious surface will result in the loss of existing protected natural resources such as the removal of over 70% of Villa Woodbine's mature tree canopy and modification to the Silver Bluff, which will reduce soil areas that accommodate drainage and adversely affect the resiliency of an already delicate area and create additional flooding of surrounding properties; and

WHEREAS, the Project's application includes a traffic methodology with an inadequate Traffic Study Area that includes only one (1) city block and does not measure the impact created by current school traffic in the larger neighborhood context; The Project's site plan configuration accommodates stacking for a maximum of 53 vehicles and accommodates no bus parking within the site and proposes the use of a staggered drop-off schedule which has been shown to impact traffic for longer durations at the Carrollton school DUCHESNE and BARAT campuses located at 3645 and 3747 Main Highway in Coconut Grove; and

WHEREAS, a June 25, 2020 Traffic Study indicates that in Coconut Grove, an area of less than five (5) square miles, there are currently eighteen (18) schools serving over 6,700 students most of which live outside the area. The existing schools currently generate 17,504 daily trips, which impacts traffic from Brickell to beyond the Cocoplum Circle. The Project will generate an additional estimated 1,438 daily trips; and

WHEREAS, a June 25, 2020 Crash Analysis Study indicates that during the past 3 years there were 138 accidents (car, bicycle, and pedestrian) within a 1/3 mile radius of the proposed school site. The Project's S. Bayshore Drive frontage is designated for the exit of vehicles, is directly opposite the entrance to Kennedy Park, and is engineered to permit only southbound turning movements, which forces vehicles traveling northbound to re-circulate back onto Tigertail Avenue where the Project's designated entry is located. This will create public safety risks and impede access for Fire Safety, Law Enforcement, and Life Rescue vehicles; and

WHEREAS, the intent of the Coconut Grove Neighborhood Conservation District NCD-3 is to establish a protective series of legislative elements to preserve the historic, heavily landscaped character of Coconut Grove's residential areas; enhance and protect Coconut Grove's natural features such as the tree canopy and green space; and protect the architectural variety within the unique single-family neighborhood; and

WHEREAS, dating from 1988, the City of Miami Planning Department required preservation of the unobstructed view of Villa Woodbine to South Bayshore Drive, its limestone bluff and major trees, most critically the Specimen Trees; and

WHEREAS, The City of Miami Planning Department further stated in 1988 that, because of the potential archaeological significance of the site, any development activity, excavation or tree removal shall be preceded by a professional archaeological survey coordinated with Dade County archaeologists. If significant areas are uncovered, conditions for mitigation shall be included as part of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY BAYSHORE IN GROVE INC AS FOLLOWS:

Section 1. Recitals. That the above recitals are confirmed, adopted, and incorporated herein and made a part hereof by reference.

Section 2. BAYSHORE IN GROVE INC opposes the Project for the above reasons and because it does not comply with the mandates of prior City requirements or the City Code concerning historic structures and environmentally protected areas.

Section 3. BAYSHORE IN GROVE INC opposes that the City approve this private school Project which will increase the City's financial burden at a time when our City faces huge reductions in real estate tax, sales tax and tourism revenue, massive job losses, and the increasing cost of climate change. The City of Miami 2020 Budget reported a \$20 million shortfall due to the ongoing economic crisis caused by Covid-19 and created initiatives within a policy framework to ensure adequate funds are available to implement sustainable economic recovery plans. Thirteen (13) private schools located in Coconut Grove pay no taxes on Assessed Value, which in 2019 totaled almost \$230,000,000. This Project is estimated to have a \$50 million Assessed Value when completed.

Section 4. BAYSHORE IN GROVE INC requests the City of Miami Commission deny the appeal filed by the Convent of the Sacred Heart of Miami, Inc. seeking to reverse the decisions of the Miami Historic and Environmental Preservation Board's denial of the application for **Item 6981 Special Certificate Of Approval** for developmental impact to significant environmental features, and for denial of the application for **Item 6982 Special Certificate Of Appropriateness** for the

demolition, restoration, alteration, and new construction, on a property located at approximately 2167 South Bayshore Dr, Miami FL, within the Environmental Preservation District- 60 and the South Bayshore Drive Scenic Transportation Corridor.

Section 4. Effective Date. That this Resolution shall be effective immediately upon adoption.

PASSED AND ADOPTED by **BAYSHORE IN GROVE INC** this 11th day of October, 2020.



Signature 10/11/2020
Date

Name: Rose Pujol

Title: Co-Founder / Director

ATTEST:



Signature 10/11/20
Date

Name: Rachel Cardello

Title: Director / Secretary